



STARK-TUSCARAWAS-WAYNE JOINT SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

9918 Wilkshire Blvd NE • Bolivar, OH 44612
330-874-2258 • 800-678-9839 • 330-874-2449 FAX
www.timetorecycle.org • district@timetorecycle.org

David Held Erica Wright
Executive Director Finance Director

BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING MINUTES

Friday, January 6, 2017 @ 9:30am

1. Roll Call

Vice Chairperson Obrecht called the meeting to order at 9:30am with the following present:

➤ Board Members:

Ann Obrecht, Wayne County Commissioner
Chris Abbuhl, Tuscarawas County Commissioner
Ron Amstutz, Wayne County Commissioner
Janet Weir Creighton, Stark County Commissioner
Kerry Metzger, Tuscarawas County Commissioner
Richard Regula, Stark County Commissioner
Joe Sciarretti, Tuscarawas County Commissioner
Sue Smail, Wayne County Commissioner
Bill Smith, Stark County Commissioner

➤ Staff Members

Executive Director David Held
Finance Director Erica Wright
Board Secretary Rachel Rothacher
Recycling Coordinator Brett Pendleton

2. Approve Friday, January 6, 2016 Board of Directors Meeting Agenda

- ❖ ***Resolution BOD-2017-01:*** Member Regula moved and Member Abbuhl seconded a motion to approve the January 6, 2017, Board of Directors meeting agenda. The motion passed unanimously.

3. Approve Friday, November 4, 2016 Board of Directors Meeting Minutes

- ❖ ***Resolution BOD-2017-02:*** Member Regula moved and Member Creighton seconded a motion to approve the November 4, 2016, Board of Directors meeting minutes. The motion passed unanimously.

BOARD of DIRECTORS

Stark
Janet Weir Creighton
Richard Regula
Bill Smith

Tuscarawas
Chris Abbuhl
Kerry Metzger
Joe Sciarretti

Wayne
Ron Amstutz
Ann Obrecht
Sue Smail

4. Election of 2017 Officers

- Current Vice Chairperson Obrecht (Wayne County) would shift to Chairperson
 - Member Creighton (Stark County) would be the next in line to serve as Vice Chairperson
 - Administrative Director Rachel Rothacher can continue serving as Board Secretary
- ❖ **Resolution BOD-2017-03:** *Member Regula moved and Member Smail seconded a motion to approve the 2017 Board of Directors Officers as presented. The motion passed unanimously.*

5. Chairperson Appoints 2017 Committees

- The purpose of each committee as well as the meeting frequency is as follows:
 - The purpose of the Budget Committee is to establish the District budget on annual basis and address any other finance issues that may arise. Typically meets only once or twice a year.
 - The purpose of the Personnel Committee is to conduct the annual evaluations of the Executive and Finance Directors and address any other personnel issues that may arise including updates to the Policy and Procedure Manual. Typically meets only once or twice a year.
 - The purpose of the Policy Committee is to develop the District Plan. Before being approved by the Ohio EPA, the Plan must be ratified by all 108 subdivisions, and this ensures fairness and ensures the programs operate smoothly. Typically meets the third Friday of every other month during planning period, so five or six times a year, for one hour.
 - The purpose of the Audit Committee is to review the results of the District’s annual audit. Meets only once a year.
 - The Landfill/Rules Committee used to meet regularly because of the high level of activity surrounding the landfills, but they haven’t met in years because no issues have arisen recently.
 - The purpose of the Records Commission is to review the results of the District’s annual record destruction per the established retention schedule (this outlines which documents must be saved and which may be destroyed as well as which must be sent to the Ohio Historical Society for review before destruction). Meets only once a year.
- If a committee member is unavailable to meet, they may designate one of the other commissioners to attend and vote on their behalf.
- The presented committee members could be approved now, and if any commissioner would like to make a change, a motion could be made in the future:

Budget Committee

Bill Smith
Chris Abbuhl
Ron Amstutz

Policy Committee

Janet Weir Creighton
Joe Sciarretti
Ron Amstutz

Landfill/Rules Committee

Richard Regula
Kerry Metzger
Sue Smail

Personnel Committee

Janet Weir Creighton
Joe Sciarretti
Ann Obrecht

Audit Committee

Janet Weir Creighton
Joe Sciarretti
Ron Amstutz

Records Commission

Bill Smith
Joe Sciarretti
Ron Amstutz

- ❖ **Resolution BOD-2017-04:** *Member Regula moved and Member Abbuhl seconded a motion to approve the 2017 Board of Directors Committee Members as presented. The motion passed unanimously.*

6. Set 2017 Board of Directors Meeting Dates

- January 6, 2017 @ 9:30am
- March 3, 2017 @ 9:30am
- May 5, 2017 @ 9:30am
- July 7, 2017 @ 9:30am
- September 1, 2017 @ 9:30am
- November 3, 2017 @ 9:30am

❖ **Resolution BOD-2017-05:** *Member Abbuhl moved and Member Smail seconded a motion to approve the 2017 Board of Directors Meeting Dates as presented. The motion passed unanimously.*

7. Public Speaks

There were no public speaks.

8. Policy Committee Report

- STW 2015 Plan Update (approved December 24, 2014)
 - 10-year Plan (2024)
 - Mandatory 3-year Plan Update (ORC 3734.56(c)). The District may do five-year updates but has found that it is better to update every three years because it keeps programs in best condition for the communities served. The programs could get outdated otherwise.
 - 15-month Planning Period: New Planning Period began September 15, 2016
- What is the purpose of the District's Plan Update?
 - Provides ten-year projections:
 - a) Solid waste generation (ensure sufficient landfill capacity)
 - b) Recycling rates (residential/commercial/industrial)
 - c) Landfill disposal rates (tipping fees)
 - Identifies recycling strategies for managing the District's programs.
 - Provides an assessment on achieving state-wide recycling and waste reduction goals.
- Policy Committee Members (Starting 2016/Two-year term)
 - 21 members total, the same makeup from each county:
 - a) The president of the board of county commissioners or their designee
 - b) The mayor of the largest municipality in each county or their designee
 - c) The commissioner of the county health department or their designee
 - d) A township representative (this is decided by the Township Trustees Association)
 - e) An industrial, commercial, or institutional representative
 - f) A public representative with no conflict (association with the waste industry)
 - g) Another public representative
 - The first four members have permanent positions and are automatically assigned, but the other three members are volunteers and serve two-year terms that may be renewed.
 - All 21 members are secured for 2017.

9. Finance Director's Report

- Estimated Revenue versus Actual Revenue (as of December 30, 2016)
 - The tipping fee funds are restricted (per House Bill 592) to the ten allowable expenses outlined in Ohio Revised Code 3734.57. These include programs set forth in our plan including recycling

January 6, 2017, Board of Directors Meeting Minutes cont.

programs, grant programs, and special waste collection programs like those for household hazardous waste and tires. Road Repairs are also one of the ten allowable expenses.

- The general fund is unrestricted and therefore can be spent on any proper public purpose. When the fund balance was being eroded by plan set forth by the Ohio EPA, the District had to supplement the general with some interest earned just to sustain programs outlined in the plan.
 - Recycling revenue is still listed the under the tipping fee fund because up until 2015 it was required to be deposited to that fund, but now it can be deposited to the general fund, which grants flexibility to spend on items outside of the plan. An opinion from the Ohio attorney general approved this. Recycling revenue is now the main source of general fund revenue.
 - The year-to-date actual general fund revenue totaled \$306,469.73 which is primarily recycling revenue. The total is down a little from last year mostly because the District was receiving money for the comingled recyclables but is now paying for the sorting of those materials. The revenue collected from the paper recyclables remained about the same.
 - The year-to-date actual tipping fee fund revenue totaled \$3,558,886.90 with \$796,447.25 from inside the District, \$2,731,501.42 from outside of the District, \$30,826.73 from outside of the state, and \$111.50 from a Bureau of Workers' Compensation refund. The landfills all received a strong volume of waste so the District collected 98% of what was projected.
 - The total of all revenue funds was \$3,865,356.63, which was very consistent with last year and the District collected 100% of what was projected.
 - The District moved some funds from the checking account into a more profitable interest bearing account so more interest was received than last year. The District has \$3.1 million in a managed portfolio with a yield of 1.38% and varying maturity dates with some having two years or less maturity. The current weighted yield as of September was .811% which was up from .685% the prior year. Interest rates have not returned to historical levels and likely will not.
- Budgeted versus Actual Expenses (as of December 30, 2016)
- The general fund total year-to-date expenses totaled \$172,995.11. That was up from the year before primarily because of the Road Repairs, which are not budgeted for in the plan but are an allowable expense so the District granted these last year because the fund balance was built up. \$300,000 was also spent on Stark County Road Repairs, but that expense came out of the tipping fee fund (the District plan allows only a maximum of \$300,000 to be spent out of the tipping fee fund).
 - The administration year-to-date expenses from the tipping fee fund totaled \$861,275.61 which is primarily payroll and benefits and supplies and administration expenses. Again, these expenses are up from last year because of the Road Repairs.
 - The recycling and county program expenses from the tipping fee fund totaled \$3,995,229.31:
 - a) \$1,283,342.42 from drop-off recycling, which includes payroll and benefits for the ten recycling drivers, the maintenance of seven recycling trucks, and the Tuscarawas County Drop-off Program contract (the reason this amount decreased a little from the year before is because the District purchased only one truck in 2016 but two trucks in 2015);
 - b) \$369,525.04 from the Yard Waste Management Program;
 - c) \$522,836.60 from the Recycling Makes Sense Grants;
 - d) \$169,500 from the Infrastructure Enhancement Grants;

January 6, 2017, Board of Directors Meeting Minutes cont.

- e) \$462,727.55 from the Program Startup Grants;
- f) \$107,261.44 from the Host Community Cleanup Grants;
- g) \$285,000 from the Sheriff Department Grants;
- h) \$325,000 from the Health Department Grants;
- i) \$245,377.68 from Education and Awareness Program; and others.
- The tipping fee fund overall totaled \$4,856,504.92 and this combined with the general fund totaled \$5,029,500.03, which is up \$1 million from the prior year because of four areas:
 - a) Road Repairs (previously explained);
 - b) the Household Hazardous Waste Program expenses increased because the District introduced a permanent HHW center and contracted with Clean Harbors and partnered with Buehler's Fresh Foods for a pilot HHW collection event (the District will offer these events in 2017 to help provide service to Tuscarawas and Wayne County residents);
 - c) Recycling Makes Sense Grants increased either because of increased tonnages reported or increased rates paid per ton;
 - d) Program Startup Grant expenses were approved beyond the budgeted \$250,000.
- The Recycling Makes Sense Grant and HHW Program expenses may recur but the other increases are non-recurring (unless the District receives Program Startup Grant requests beyond the budgeted \$150,000 for 2017, but the Board would approve those), and the District doesn't anticipate spending this amount every year.
- Current Cash Position (as of December 30, 2016)
 - Beginning year balance was \$6,585,827.76 plus the revenue of \$3,865,356.63 less the expenses of \$5,029,500.03, so the unexpended balance at the end of the year was \$5,421,684.36.
 - The general fund year-to-date net gain is \$133,474.62, the tipping fee fund year-to-date net loss is \$1,297,618.02, and the grand total year-to-date net loss is \$1,164,143.40. The loss is primarily because of the road repairs and other previously mentioned items.
- Tipping Fee Revenue Update
 - The numbers are based on revenue collected from the landfills for the first 11 months of 2016; no year-end number until the end of January.
 - The 2016 tipping fees totaled \$3,108,107.48, which is down 8% from last year.
 - The District budgeted for \$3,615,000 in 2016 and received \$3,570,975.83 in 2015.
 - The District expected to receive \$3,394,242 last year and received \$3,558,775.40.
 - The District will probably project \$3.5 million for 2017, but this won't be official until the final numbers are in. It isn't anticipated that the fees will grow much.
 - Tipping fees bottomed out at \$2.7 million in 2010, and they were slowly growing until last year and then levelled off. The height of fees received was \$6.4 million in 2004. Tipping fee fluctuations are market driven and can change due to contractual changes with waste and what other district rates are
- 2017 General Liability and Property Insurance Renewal
 - 2017 Insurance Renewal Premium through Leonard Insurance is \$34,488
 - Previous 2016 rate was \$26,584; Increase in commercial auto coverage

January 6, 2017, Board of Directors Meeting Minutes cont.

- Account was marketed with other carriers for competitive rate but declined due to Loss Reserve (June 2014 accident case still open and carries a \$450,000 reserve. There were also three other claims totaling \$99,000).
 - Leonard Insurance has timely and responsive service
 - Only change in coverage was an increase in the building coverage from \$958,120 to \$965,951
 - One-year contract with Leonard Insurance expires January 19, 2018
 - The District was also approached by Public Entities Pool of Ohio (599 members) and they were going to submit a proposal with a more competitive rate, but the District hadn't been approved. The Pool is set up differently than other carriers (it takes six years to get vested and there are penalties for withdrawing). The Carrier recommended that it was not the best time to switch carriers because of the reserve, but this option could be explored in the future.
- ❖ **Resolution BOD-2017-06:** *Member Amstutz moved and Member Creighton seconded a motion to approve the District's 2017 general liability and property insurance coverage renewal through Leonard Insurance at a rate of \$34,488 for the period of January 19, 2017 through January 19, 2018.*
- 2017 Mileage Reimbursement
- Federal Rate is 53.5 cents per mile
 - Board, Policy & Committee Members eligible for personal miles to attend District meetings
 - Members must submit a Board/Policy Member Expense Reimbursement Report, which can be provided, and can submit the report each meeting, monthly, quarterly or annually.
- 2017 Minimum Wage Increase
- The only District employees that receive minimum wage are Seasonal Workers/Interns. The current Seasonal Worker/Intern hourly rate is \$8.10 per hour and Federal Minimum Wage is \$7.25 per hour.
 - Typically, one Seasonal Worker is employed in the summer to help clean up drop-off sites. This employee usually works 40 hours a week for twelve weeks.
 - In 2016, the District also employed an Intern who helped with administrative work. The District brings on interns as needed to assist with various projects.
- ❖ **Resolution BOD-2017-07:** *Member Metzger moved and Member Smail seconded a motion to increase the seasonal worker hourly rate to \$8.15 per hour retroactive to January 1, 2017 to align with the State of Ohio Minimum Wage.*

10. Executive Director's Report

- Recycling Drop-off Site Improvements
- Site Contamination Solutions include increasing pickup frequency, increasing number of containers, increasing signage, increasing number of cleanups, adding fencing/gates, and adding cameras
 - Improved Recycling Drop-off Sites include New Philadelphia Buehler's & Newcomerstown Village
 - Mill Township and Taft Elementary site improvements will be completed in 2017.

January 6, 2017, Board of Directors Meeting Minutes cont.

- a) The City of Uhrichsville, near Mill Township, used to have drop-off site that was also heavily contaminated, but when they got a curbside recycling program, they removed the site and now people dump at the Mill Township site.
 - b) The Taft Elementary site is not very deep and is hazardous to the recycling truck drivers, who must back into the street to empty the bins, so the lot will be expanded.
- Stark County Recycling Garage Paving (6 Recycling Trucks)
- Project Manager: John Patrick Picard Architect
 - Architect's Estimate: not to exceed \$175,000 (May be able to use concrete for same price or better)
 - Work to be completed in spring 2017
- Streamlining of Weight Sheets
- The District used to have four additional staff members (some positions were cut when tipping fee revenue dropped), so some District processes had to be made more efficient.
 - Drivers can now submit weights on tablets and District staff can access on computers:
 - a) Automatically calculates totals and identifies errors
 - b) Reduces staff hours (no duplication of data entry)
 - c) Eliminates transportation time/postage paid
- Drop-Off vs Curbside Recycling Tonnages (2007-2016)
- If residents were all recycling at the same rate, total weight would decrease because there is less paper waste (fewer newspapers and several companies moving to paperless billing), which is heavier, and there is more plastic and cardboard waste (especially shipping boxes), which is lighter.
 - Overall recycling continues to increase (103% increase in total recycling from 2007 to 2016) in part because some curbside recycling programs were added from 2013 to 2015 or because several curbside programs switched from smaller containers to larger wheeled containers during that time, and this typically increases residential recycling rates.
 - The District stopped adding drop-off sites because the required 90% access was already met and adding more sites means increased expenses (more bins, drivers and trucks).
- Total District Yard Waste Expenses (2008-2018 Projection)
- From 2012 to 2014, there was no cost for the District's Yard Waste Collection Program. There was a higher value for yard waste material which was used for fuel, paper products and compost.
 - Demand for this material has decreased, so now the District must pay to haul. As an example, it costs \$60,000 to haul from the Jackson Township drop-off site alone.
 - The contracted company for the Stark County program wanted to double cost in 2017, but the District negotiated to maintain terms and rates until the end of the contract term (2018).
 - Expenses in 2016 were \$369,525.
 - 2017 Projected District Yard Waste Rates are \$112.36/40-yard load & \$224.72/80-yard load in Stark County and \$195/30-yard load in Tuscarawas County for a total projected cost of \$406,532.
 - 2018 Projected District Yard Waste Rates are \$225/40-yard load & \$400/80-yard load in Stark County and \$195/30-yard load in Tuscarawas County for a total projected cost of \$776,759.
 - The District Board and Policy will be reviewing program cost efficiency and effectiveness in 2017.

11. Grant and District Programs

- 20 Curbside Recycling Programs (STW-01)
 - 11 out of 12 District Municipalities have Curbside Programs.
 - The City of Louisville is the only municipality without a curbside recycling program, and it does not contract out the waste hauling, which can make it more difficult to implement curbside recycling.
- 75 Drop-Off Recycling Program Sites (STW-02)
 - The District maintains over 400 recycling bins in all three counties.
 - The location of recycling drop-off sites is population driven. The District must have at least one drop-off for every 5,000 people, so the sites are instrumental in meeting the 90% access requirement.
- 15 Yard Waste Management Program Sites (STW-03)
 - The District has more yard waste sites in areas with more concentrated populations.
 - There is not as much of a demand for yard waste sites in rural areas.
 - The Wayne County program has no cost because residents take directly to the composting sites.
 - There are three sites in Tuscarawas County to manage the yard waste in the densely populated areas.
 - The Stark County yard waste collection program used to have 15 site but now has ten.
 - The expense to collect yard waste currently exceeds the value of the commodity.
- Household Hazardous Waste (HHW) Management Program (STW-05)
 - Currently 31 Pharmaceutical Collection Locations in the District
 - When drugs are no longer needed, they are stored and can be stolen or used improperly leading to overdose. Residents want to dispose of properly and throwing away or flushing is not recommended.
 - The Medway Drug Enforcement Agency collects the drugs in Wayne County (it is funded through property taxes). The District-funded litter deputies collect the drugs in Stark & Tuscarawas County.
 - Drugs collected through the District program are incinerated. Timken Steel is now able to take the drugs collected through the Stark County program once a month no cost, and the drugs collected through the Tuscarawas and Wayne County Programs are taken to Ross Environmental for a cost (there is some restriction as to what items can be collected).
 - The District's HHW Collection Program used to average 2,500 cars a day with four events. Cost for this program was about a million dollars.
 - Now, the District partners with the City of Canton Health Department and has a year-round collection site at the Canton City Recycle Center:
 - a) Open to all District Residents (By Appointment) for no cost
 - b) Hours: Tuesday & Thursday 9am-3pm (Every last Tuesday of the month open until 6pm)
 - c) Acceptable items: pesticides, cleaners, automotive fluids, etc.
- Buehler's Collection Events (STW-05, -06, -07, -08 & -09)
 - New in 2017: HHW will be accepted at the Tuscarawas & Wayne County General Collection Events
 - Waste will be collected by the same company that collects the waste from the permanent HHW site.
 - 2017 Event Dates:
 - a) Saturday, May 20, 2017, Wooster Milltown, 10 a.m. - 3 p.m., General Collection
 - b) Saturday, June 10, 2017, Dover, 10 a.m. - 3 p.m., General Collection
 - c) Saturday, July 15, 2017, Canton-Nobles Pond, 10 a.m. - 3 p.m., Electronic Collection

January 6, 2017, Board of Directors Meeting Minutes cont.

- d) Saturday, Aug. 19, 2017, Wooster Milltown, 9 a.m. – noon, Paper Shred Event
- e) Saturday, Sept. 23, 2017, Orrville, 10 a.m. - 3 p.m., General Collection
- f) Saturday, Oct. 7, 2017, New Philadelphia, 10 a.m. - 3 p.m., General Collection
- 4 Scrap Tire Collection Program Sites (STW-06)
 - Residents may drop off 12 tires a year at no cost. This helps keep mosquito populations down.
 - The District also has a Tire Pass Program where Political Subdivisions may collect scrap tires and transport to tire recycling processor (either Liberty Tire in Stark County or Black Bounce in Holmes County) and the District will pay for recycling of tires.
- Allocation of Grant Funding 2017 (Total: \$1,591,286)
 - The program with the most funding allocated (33% of all grant funding) is the Recycling Makes Sense Grant Program, which awards up to \$50 per ton for recyclables.
 - The Health Department will receive the next largest amount of funding (22%) to fund sanitarians to inspect landfills, open dumps, infectious waste facilities, and more.
 - The Sheriff Department will receive 18% of the total grant funding to employ one litter deputy in each county to address dumping, littering, and issues at the recycling sites.
 - The Program Startup Grant Program (10%) funds fencing, cameras, and other site improvements.
 - The Recycling/Composting Infrastructure Enhancement Grant Program (10%) awards funding to private sector companies to help fill recycling gaps and ensure the District has a place to take recyclables. The District likely won't award any grants this year because there isn't much need.
 - The Host Community Cleanup Grants (6%) ensure the sites are cleaned up.
 - Mini-Grants make up only 1% of total funding allocated in 2017.
- 2016 Recycling Newsletters (STW-29 Education and Awareness Program)
 - All 268,873 households in the District received a copy in the mail December. The District typically sends out this month to be sensitive to political campaigns.
 - The Newsletter was 16 pages long and included a pre-paid tear-out survey. More than 2,000 surveys have been received so far.

12. Other Business

There was no other business.

13. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 10:55am.



3-3-17

Rachel Rothacher, Board Secretary

Date